

1 ANDREW P. THOMAS
MARICOPA COUNTY ATTORNEY
2 By: Colleen Connor (# 015679)
Deputy County Attorney
MCAO Firm No. 00032000
3 CIVIL DIVISION
4 222 North Central Avenue, Suite 1100
Phoenix, Arizona 85004-2206
5 Telephone (602) 506-0128
connorc@mcao.maricopa.gov

6 Dennis I. Wilenchik (# 05350)
Kathleen Rapp (# 023982)
7 WILENCHIK AND BARTNESS, P.C.
The Wilenchik & Bartness Building
8 2810 North Third Street
Phoenix, Arizona 85004
9 (602) 606-2810
DIW@wb-law.com; KatheenR@wb-law.com
10 Attorneys for County Defendants

11 IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE DISTRICT OF ARIZONA

12 MARIA M. GONZALES; JESUS M.
13 GONZALES; BERNIE ABEYTIA;
LUCIANO VALENCIA; DEBBIE LOPEZ,
14 SOUTHWEST VOTER REGISTRATION
EDUCATION PROJECT; VALLE DEL
15 SOL; FRIENDLY HOUSE; CHICANOS
POR LA CAUSA, INC.; and ARIZONA
16 HISPANIC FORUM,

17 Plaintiffs,

18 v.

19 STATE OF ARIZONA, JAN BREWER, in
her official capacity as the Secretary of
20 State of the State of Arizona, et al.,

21 Defendants.
22

No. CV06-1268-PHX ROS (Lead)
No. CV06-1362-PCT-JAT
No. CV06-1575-PHX-EHC

**COUNTY DEFENDANTS'
RESPONSE TO
SUPPLEMENTAL BRIEF OF
NAVAJO NATION AND AGNES
LAUGHTER**

(Assigned to the Honorable
Roslyn O. Silver)

1 Defendants Maricopa County Recorder Helen Purcell and Maricopa
2 County Elections Director Karen Osborne; Apache County Recorder LeNora
3 Johnson and Apache County Elections Director Penny L. Pew; Cochise County
4 Recorder Christine Rhodes and Cochise County Elections Director Thomas
5 Schelling; Gila County Recorder Linda Haught Ortega and Gila County Elections
6 Director Dixie Mundy; Graham County Recorder Wendy John and Graham
7 County Elections Director Judy Dickerson; Greenlee County Recorder Berta
8 Manuz and Greenlee County Elections Director Yvonne Pearson; La Paz
9 County Recorder Shelly Baker and La Paz County Elections Director Donna
10 Hale; Mohave County Recorder Joan McCall and Mohave County Elections
11 Director Allen Tempert; Navajo County Recorder Laurette Justman and Navajo
12 County Elections Director Kelly Dastrup; Pima County Recorder F. Ann
13 Rodriguez and Pima County Elections Director Brad R. Nelson; Pinal County
14 Recorder Laura Dean-Lytle and Pinal County Elections Director Gilberto Hoyos;
15 Santa Cruz County Recorder Suzie Sainz and Santa Cruz County Elections
16 Director Melinda Meek; Yavapai County Recorder Ana Wayman-Trujillo and
17 Yavapai County Elections Director Lynn A. Constabile; and Yuma County
18 Recorder Susan Hightower Marler and Yuma County Elections Director Patti
19 Madrill (collectively "County Defendants"), by and through undersigned counsel,
20 hereby respond to the Court's Order dated September 11, 2006 for
21 supplemental briefing on whether the identification requirements on the Voting
22 Rights Act and Civil Rights Act claims.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22

STATEMENT OF COUNTY DEFENDANTS

The County Defendants are nominal parties in this action and take no position on whether the voter identification requirements violate the Voting Rights Act and Civil Rights Act. Pursuant to Arizona Revised Statutes (“A.R.S.”) §16-579, every qualified elector must present identification to vote a regular ballot at the polls. While the County Recorders and County Elections Directors are required to comply with State law, the County Defendants take no position on the constitutionality of the voter identification requirements.

DATED this 4th day of October 2006.

ANDREW P. THOMAS
MARICOPA COUNTY ATTORNEY

BY: s/ Colleen Connor
COLLEEN CONNOR
Deputy County Attorney
222 North Central Avenue, Suite 1100
Phoenix, Arizona 85004-2206

WILENCHIK & BARTNESS, P.C.
Dennis I. Wilenchik, Esq.
Kathleen E. Rapp, Esq.
The Wilenchik & Bartness Building
2810 North Third Street
Phoenix, Arizona 85004
Attorneys for County Defendants

1 Copy of the forgoing electronically
transmitted via the U.S. District Court's
2 Electronic Case Filing System
this 4th day of October 2006 and to:

3
4 Nina Perales
Diego Bernal
MEXICAN AMERICAN LEGAL
5 DEFENSE AND EDUCATIONAL FUND
110 Broadway, Suite 300
6 San Antonio, TX 78205
Attorneys for Plaintiffs Gonzales

7
8 Daniel R. Ortega, Jr.
ROUSH, McCRACKEN, GUERRERO,
MILLER & ORTEGA
9 650 North Third Avenue
Phoenix, AZ 85003
10 Attorneys for Plaintiffs Gonzales

11 David B. Rosenbaum
Thomas L. Hudson
12 Sara S. Greene
OSBORNE MALEDON, P.A.
13 2929 N. Central Ave., 21st Floor
Phoenix, AZ 85012
14 Attorneys for Plaintiffs ITCA

15 David J. Bodney
Karen J. Hartman-Tellez
16 STEPTOE & JOHNSON LLP
201 East Washington Street, Suite 1600
17 Phoenix, AZ 85004
Attorneys for Plaintiffs ITCA

18
19 Judith Dworkin
Marvin Cohen
Patricia Ferguson-Bohnee
20 SACKS TIERNEY P.A.
4250 N. Drinkwater Blvd.
21 Scottsdale, AZ 85251-3693
Attorneys for Plaintiffs Navajo Nation

22

1 Dana Broboff
The Navajo Nation Dept. of Justice
2 P.O. Drawer 2010
Window Rock, AZ 86515
3 Attorneys for Plaintiffs Navajo Nation

4 Mary O'Grady
Peter Silverman
5 William A. Richards
Arizona Attorney General's Office
6 1275 West Washington
Phoenix, AZ 85007
7 Attorneys for Defendants State of Arizona

8 Terrence C. Hance
Jean E. Wilcox
9 Coconino County Attorney's Office
110 E. Cherry Avenue
10 Flagstaff, AZ 86001
Attorneys for Coconino County Defendants

11

12 s/Shelley Cottrell

13

14 S:\COUNSEL\Civil\Staff\CONNOR\Identification Requirements\Gonzales v. Brewer MALDEF\Navajo Nation\Supplemental Brief on Navajo Nation Claims.doc

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22