

1 Nina Perales, TX SBN: 24005046  
Diego Bernal, TX SBN: 24048350  
2 MEXICAN AMERICAN LEGAL  
DEFENSE AND EDUCATIONAL FUND  
110 Broadway, Suite 300  
3 San Antonio, TX 78205  
Ph: (210) 224-5476  
nperales@maldef.org  
4 dbernal@maldef.org

5 Daniel R. Ortega, Jr., SBN: 005015  
ROUSH, MCCRACKEN, GUERRERO,  
MILLER & ORTEGA  
6 650 North Third Avenue  
Phoenix, Arizona 85003  
7 Ph: (602) 253-3554  
danny@rmgmoinjurylaw.com

8 Karl J. Sandstrom  
PERKINS COIE, LLP  
9 607 Fourteenth Street, N.W., Suite 800  
Washington, D.C. 20005  
10 (202)434-1639  
ksansdstrom@perkinscoie.com

11 Attorneys for Gonzalez Plaintiffs

12 IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
13 FOR THE DISTRICT OF ARIZONA

14 Maria M. Gonzalez, et al., ) No. CV-06-1268-PHX-ROS(Lead)  
) No. CV-06-1362-PCT-JAT(Cons.)  
Plaintiffs, ) No. CV-06-1575-PHX-EHC(Cons.)  
15 )  
vs. ) STIPULATION BY GONZALEZ  
16 ) PLAINTIFFS, COUNTY  
State of Arizona, et al, ) DEFENDANTS AND STATE  
) DEFENDANTS REGARDING  
17 Defendants. ) EXHIBITS RELATED TO NAVAJO  
) COUNTY  
18 )  
) (Assigned to the  
19 ) Honorable Roslyn O. Silver)

20 COME NOW Gonzalez Plaintiffs together with Defendants Maricopa County  
21 Recorder Helen Purcell and Maricopa County Elections Director Karen Osborne;  
22

1 Apache County Recorder LeNora Johnson and Apache County Elections Director Penny  
2 L. Pew; Cochise County Recorder Christine Rhodes and Cochise County Elections  
3 Director Thomas Schelling; Gila County Recorder Linda Haught Ortega and Gila  
4 County Elections Director Dixie Mundy; Graham County Recorder Wendy John and  
5 Graham County Elections Director Judy Dickerson; Greenlee County Recorder Berta  
6 Manuz and Greenlee County Elections Director Yvonne Pearson; La Paz County  
7 Recorder Shelly Baker and La Paz County Elections Director Donna Hale; Mohave  
8 County Recorder Joan McCall and Mohave County Elections Director Allen Tempert;  
9 Pima County Recorder F. Ann Rodriguez and Pima County Elections Director Brad R.  
10 Nelson; Santa Cruz County Recorder Suzie Sainz and Santa Cruz County Elections  
11 Director Melinda Meek; Yavapai County Recorder Ana Wayman-Trujillo and Yavapai  
12 County Elections Director Lynn A. Constabile; and Yuma County Recorder Susan  
13 Hightower Marler and Yuma County Elections Director Patti Madrill (collectively  
14 “County Defendants”) and Defendants State of Arizona and Jan Brewer “State  
15 Defendants” enter into the following stipulation.

16 For the purposes of trial, the Parties agree not to dispute the authenticity,  
17 foundation or hearsay, insofar as a County Defendant would be able to testify to the  
18 same. This stipulation applies to Gonzalez Plaintiffs’ Trial Exhibits 330, 406, 419, 486,  
19 218, 240, 245, and 246. These exhibits relate to Navajo County.

20 Previously, Navajo County entered into a stipulation (Doc. 903) regarding the  
21 admissibility of Gonzalez Plaintiffs’ Trial Exhibits that were produced by Navajo  
22 County. The State and Twelve County Defendants objected to that stipulation and

1 maintain their objection. The parties do not waive other objections, such as hearsay  
2 within hearsay, which the testimony of a County Defendant could not remedy. Such  
3 objections are expressly reserved for trial.

4 The parties further stipulate that if the above-referenced documents are deemed  
5 by the Court to be authentic, have proper foundation and not contain hearsay, the  
6 testimony of the Navajo County Defendants is not needed at trial and Gonzalez Plaintiffs  
7 voluntarily withdraw the subpoenas of these officials.

8 **RESPECTFULLY SUBMITTED** this 11th day of July, 2008

9  
10 By: s/Nina Perales  
Nina Perales

11 **Counsel for Plaintiffs**  
12 **Gonzalez, et al.**

13 By: s/ Nina Perales for  
14 Dennis I. Wilenchik (# 05350)  
Kathleen Rapp (# 023982)  
15 WILENCHIK AND BARTNESS, P.C.  
The Wilenchik & Bartness Building  
2810 North Third Street  
16 Phoenix, Arizona 85004  
Telephone (602) 606-2810  
17 DIW@wb-law.com  
KatheenR@wb-law.com  
18 **Attorneys for County Defendant**

19  
20 By: s/ Nina Perales for  
Mary O'Grady  
21 Solicitor Attorney General  
Steven La Mar  
Senior Litigation Counsel  
22 Barbara Bailey

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22

Assistant Attorney General  
1275 West Washington Street  
Phoenix, Arizona 86007  
**Attorneys for State Defendants**

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on the 11th day of July, 2008, I caused the foregoing document to be electronically transmitted to the Clerk’s Office using the CM/ECF System for filing and transmittal of a Notice of Electronic Filing to CM/ECF registrants.

COPY of the foregoing filed electronically this 11<sup>th</sup> day of July, 2008.

COPY of the foregoing mailed with Notice of Electronic Filing this 11<sup>th</sup> day of July, 2008 to:

The Honorable Roslyn O. Silver  
United States District Court  
Sandra Day O’Connor U.S. Courthouse, Suite 624  
401 West Washington Street, SPC 59  
Phoenix, AZ 85003-2158

s/Nina Perales  
Nina Perales