

1 OSBORN MALEDON, P.A.
2 2929 North Central Avenue, 21st Floor
3 Phoenix, Arizona 85012-2793
4 Telephone: (602) 640-9000

5 David B. Rosenbaum (009819)
6 drosenbaum@omlaw.com
7 Thomas L. Hudson (014485)
8 thudson@omlaw.com
9 Sara S. Greene (022706)
10 sgreene@omlaw.com

11 STEPTOE & JOHNSON LLP
12 Collier Center
13 201 East Washington Street, Suite 1600
14 Phoenix, Arizona 85004-2382
15 Telephone: (602) 257-5200
16 Facsimile: (602) 257-5299

17 David J. Bodney (006065)
18 dbodney@steptoe.com
19 Karen J. Hartman-Tellez (021121)
20 khartman@steptoe.com

21 Attorneys for The Inter Tribal Council
22 of Arizona, Inc., et al.

23 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
24 DISTRICT OF ARIZONA

25 Maria M. Gonzalez, et al.,
26 Plaintiffs,

27 vs.

28 State of Arizona, et al.,
Defendants.

) No. CV06-01268-PHX-ROS (Lead)
) CV06-01362-PHX-ROS (Cons)

) **PLAINTIFFS' JOINT**
) **RESPONSE IN OPPOSITION TO**
) **DEFENDANTS' MOTION TO**
) **ADMIT TRIAL EXHIBITS**

29 The Gonzalez Plaintiffs and the ITCA Plaintiffs (collectively, "Plaintiffs")
30 hereby jointly oppose the Motion to Admit Trial Exhibits filed by the State and Twelve
31 County Defendants. Plaintiffs' bases for opposing the admission of Trial Exhibits
32 1349a-1349g, 1349y and 1349z are set forth in the right-hand column of the chart
33 attached hereto as Exhibit A.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

RESPECTFULLY SUBMITTED this 21st day of July, 2008.

STEPTOE & JOHNSON LLP

By Karen J. Hartman-Tellez
David J. Bodney
Karen J. Hartman-Tellez
Collier Center
201 East Washington St., Ste. 1600
Phoenix, Arizona 85004-2382

OSBORN MALEDON, P.A
David B. Rosenbaum
Thomas L. Hudson
Sara S. Greene
2929 North Central Ave., 21st Floor
Phoenix, Arizona 85012-2793

Attorneys for The Inter Tribal Council
of Arizona, Inc., et al.

MEXICAN AMERICAN LEGAL
DEFENSE AND EDUCATIONAL
FUND

By Karen J. Hartman-Tellez for
Nina Perales
Diego Bernal
110 Broadway
Suite 300
San Antonio, Texas 78205

Attorneys for Jesus M. Gonzalez, et al.

1 LAWYERS' COMMITTEE FOR CIVIL
RIGHTS UNDER LAW

2 Jon M. Greenbaum
3 Robert A. Kengle
4 1401 New York Avenue, Suite 400
5 Washington, D.C. 20005
6 Telephone: 202-662-8315
7 Fax: (202) 628-2858
8 E-mail:
9 jgreenbaum@lawyerscommittee.org
10 bkengle@lawyerscommittee.org
11 *Admitted Pro Hac Vice*

12 ACLU Southern Regional Office

13 Neil Bradley
14 2600 Marquis One Tower
15 245 Peachtree Center Avenue
16 Atlanta, Georgia 30303
17 Telephone: 404-523-2721
18 Fax: 404-653-0331
19 E-mail: nbradley@aclu.org
20 *Admitted Pro Hac Vice*

21 THE LEAGUE OF UNITED LATIN
22 AMERICAN CITIZENS

23 Luis Roberto Vera, Jr.
24 (TX SBN 20546740)
25 111 Soledad, Suite 1325
26 San Antonio, Texas 78205-2260
27 Telephone: 210-225-3300
28 Fax: 210-225-2060
E-mail: lrvlaw@sbcglobal.net
Pro Hac Vice Application to be filed

AARP FOUNDATION LITIGATION

Daniel B. Kohrman (DC BN 394064)
601 E Street, N.W., Suite A4-240
Washington, DC 20049
Telephone: 202-434-2064
Fax: 202-434-6424
E-mail: dkohrman@aarp.org
Admitted Pro Hac Vice

THE INTER TRIBAL COUNCIL OF
ARIZONA, INC.

Joe P. Sparks (002383)
The Sparks Law Firm PC
7503 First Street
Scottsdale Arizona 85251
Telephone: 480-949-1339
Fax: 480-949-7587
E-mail: joesparks@sparkslawaz.com

Attorneys for the Inter Tribal Council of
Arizona, Inc., et al.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

Mary Ruth O’Grady
mary.ogrady@azag.gov

Daniel R. Ortega, Jr.
danny@rmgmo.com

Luis Fernando Parra
lparra@co.santa-cruz.az.us

Lance B. Payette
lance.payette@co.navajo.az.us

Nina Perales
nperales@maldef.org

Javier Garcia Ramos
javier.ramos@sackstierney.com

Chris Myrl Roll
Chris.Roll@co.pinal.az.us

Karl J. Sandstrom
ksandstrom@perkinscoie.com

Joe P. Sparks
joesparks@sparkslawaz.com

Thomas M. Stoxen
thomas.stoxen@co.yavapai.az.us

David Urias
durias@maldef.org, mmartinez@maldef.org

Nicole Weber
Nicole.Weber@co.pinal.az.us

Jean E. Wilcox
jwilcox@coconino.az.gov

Dennis Ira Wilenchik
diw@wb-law.com

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

I further certify that I caused a copy of the attached document to be mailed
on the 21st day of July, 2008 to:

Honorable Roslyn O. Silver
Sandra Day O'Connor U.S. Courthouse
Suite 624
401 West Washington, SPC 59
Phoenix, Arizona 85003-2158

s/ Carole Hauser
Legal Secretary