

1 TERRY GODDARD  
Attorney General  
2 Firm Bar No. 14000  
3 Mary O'Grady, No. 011434  
Solicitor General  
4 Steven A. LaMar, No. 004140  
Senior Litigation Counsel  
5 Carrie J. Brennan, No. 018250  
6 Barbara A. Bailey, No. 018230  
Assistant Attorneys General  
7 1275 West Washington Street  
Phoenix, Arizona 85007-2926  
8 Tel: (602) 542-3333  
9 Fax: (602) 542-8308  
Attorneys for Arizona Secretary of State Janice Brewer

10 **IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**  
11 **DISTRICT OF ARIZONA**

12 MARIA M. GONZALEZ, et al.,  
13  
14 Plaintiffs,  
15 v.  
16 STATE OF ARIZONA, et al.  
17 Defendants.

No. CV06-01268 PHX ROS  
No. CV06-1362 PCT ROS (Cons)  
No. CV06-1575 PCT ROS (Cons)

**DEFENDANT'S RESPONSE TO  
ITCA PLAINTIFFS' MOTION FOR  
ADMISSION OF TRIAL EXHIBITS**

(Assigned to the Honorable  
Roslyn O. Silver)

21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

1 Defendant Arizona Secretary of State Janice Brewer (“Defendant”) responds to  
2 ITCA Plaintiffs’ Motion for Admission of Trial Exhibits, dkt. 998, by submitting the  
3 attached chart, which sets forth Defendant’s respective objections to the offered  
4 exhibits.

5 Based on the objections set forth, the Court should deny Plaintiffs’ motion.

6 RESPECTFULLY SUBMITTED this 21st day of July, 2008.

7 TERRY GODDARD  
8 Arizona Attorney General

9 s/ Barbara A. Bailey  
10 Mary O’Grady, Solicitor General  
11 Steven A. LaMar, Senior Litigation Counsel  
12 Carrie J. Brennan, Assistant Attorney General  
13 Barbara A. Bailey, Assistant Attorney General  
14 Attorneys for Defendants State of Arizona  
15 and Arizona Secretary of State Janice Brewer  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

1 **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

2 I hereby certify that on this 21st day of July, 2008, I electronically transmitted  
3 the attached document to the Clerk’s Office using the ECF System for filing, and  
4 transmittal of a Notice of Electronic Filing to the following ECF registrants:  
5

6 David J. Bodney  
7 Karen J. Hartman-Tellez  
8 Steptoe & Johnson LLP  
9 201 East Washington St., Ste. 1600  
10 Phoenix, Arizona 85004-2382  
11 [dbodney@steptoe.com](mailto:dbodney@steptoe.com)  
12 [khartman@steptoe.com](mailto:khartman@steptoe.com)

13 David B. Rosenbaum  
14 Thomas L. Hudson  
15 Sara S. Greene  
16 Osborn Maledon, P.A.  
17 2929 N. Central, 21<sup>st</sup> Floor  
18 Phoenix, Arizona 85012-2793  
19 [drosenbaum@omlaw.com](mailto:drosenbaum@omlaw.com)  
20 [thudson@omlaw.com](mailto:thudson@omlaw.com)  
21 [sgreene@omlaw.com](mailto:sgreene@omlaw.com)

22 Jon Greenbaum  
23 Benjamin Blustein  
24 Lawyers’ Committee For  
25 Civil Rights Under Law  
26 1401 New York Avenue, Ste. 400  
27 Washington, D.C. 20005  
28 [jgreenbaum@lawyerscommittee.org](mailto:jgreenbaum@lawyerscommittee.org)

29 Neil Bradley  
30 ACLU Southern Regional Office  
31 2600 Marquis One Tower  
32 245 Peachtree Center Avenue  
33 Atlanta, Georgia 30303  
34 [nbradley@aclu.org](mailto:nbradley@aclu.org)

1 Elliot M. Mincberg  
2 People for the American  
3 Way Foundation  
4 2600 M Street, NW, Ste. 400  
5 Washington, DC 20036  
6 [eminberg@pfaw.org](mailto:eminberg@pfaw.org)

7 Daniel B. Kohrman  
8 AARP Foundation Litigation  
9 601 E Street, N.W., Ste. A4-240  
10 Washington, DC 20049  
11 [dkohrman@aarp.org](mailto:dkohrman@aarp.org)

12 Joe P. Sparks  
13 Susan B. Montgomery  
14 Sparks, Tehan & Ryley PC  
15 The Inter Tribal Council of Arizona, Inc.  
16 7503 First Street  
17 Scottsdale, Arizona 85251  
18 [joe-sparks@qwest.net](mailto:joe-sparks@qwest.net)

19 David J. Becker  
20 People for the American Way Foundation  
21 2000 M Street, NW, Suite 400  
22 Washington, D.C. 20036  
23 [dbecker@pfaw.org](mailto:dbecker@pfaw.org)

24 Daniel R. Ortega, Jr.  
25 Roush McCracken Guerrero  
26 Miller & Ortega  
27 650 N. 3<sup>rd</sup> Avenue  
28 Phoenix, Arizona 85003  
[danny@rmgmoinjurylaw.com](mailto:danny@rmgmoinjurylaw.com)

Nina Perales  
Mexican American Legal Defense and Education Fund  
110 Broadway, Ste. 300  
San Antonio, Texas 78205  
[nperales@maldef.org](mailto:nperales@maldef.org)

1 M. Colleen Connor  
2 MCAO Division of County Counsel  
3 222 N. Central Avenue, Ste. 1100  
4 Phoenix, Arizona 85003  
[connorc@mcao.maricopa.gov](mailto:connorc@mcao.maricopa.gov)

5 Dennis I. Wilenchik  
6 Kathleen Rapp  
7 Wilenchik and Bartness, P.C.  
8 2810 N. Third Street  
9 Phoenix, Arizona 85004  
[diw@wb-law.com](mailto:diw@wb-law.com)  
[kathleenr@wb-law.com](mailto:kathleenr@wb-law.com)

10 Judith M. Dworkin  
11 Marvin S. Cohen  
12 Patricia Ferguson-Bohnee  
13 SACKS TIERNEY P.A.  
14 4250 N. Drinkwater Blvd. 4<sup>th</sup>  
15 Scottsdale, Arizona 85251-3693  
[Judith.Dworkin@sackstierney.com](mailto:Judith.Dworkin@sackstierney.com)

16 Criss E. Candelaria  
17 Bradley Carlyon  
18 Apache County Attorneys Office  
19 PO Box 637  
20 St. Johns, Arizona 86025  
[bcarlyon@apachelaw.net](mailto:bcarlyon@apachelaw.net)

21 Melvin R. Bowers, Jr.  
22 Lance B. Payette  
23 Navajo County Attorneys Office  
24 PO Box 668  
25 Holbrook, Arizona 86025  
[lance.payette@co.navajo.az.us](mailto:lance.payette@co.navajo.az.us)

26 Brenna L. Clani  
27 Navajo County Department of Justice  
28 PO Box 2010  
Window Rock, Arizona 86515  
[brennalclani@navajo.org](mailto:brennalclani@navajo.org)

1 Jean E. Wilcox  
2 Coconino County Attorney's Office  
3 110 East Cherry Ave.  
4 Flagstaff, Arizona 86001  
5 [jwilcox@coconino.az.gov](mailto:jwilcox@coconino.az.gov)

6 **COPY** served the 21st day of July, 2008, via U.S. mail, with Notice of Electronic  
7 Filing, on:

8 The Honorable Roslyn O. Silver  
9 United States District Court  
10 Sandra Day O'Connor U.S. Courthouse, Suite 624  
11 401 West Washington Street, SPC 59  
12 Phoenix, AZ 85003-2158

13 /s Elizabeth Stark

14  
15 250869  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28