

1 TERRY GODDARD  
Attorney General  
2 Firm Bar No. 14000  
3 Mary O'Grady, No. 011434  
Solicitor General  
4 Steven A. LaMar, No. 004140  
Senior Litigation Counsel  
5 Carrie J. Brennan, No. 018250  
6 Barbara A. Bailey, No. 018230  
Assistant Attorneys General  
7 1275 West Washington Street  
Phoenix, Arizona 85007-2926  
8 Tel: (602) 542-3333  
9 Fax: (602) 542-8308  
Attorneys for State of Arizona and  
10 Arizona Secretary of State Janice Brewer

11 **IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**  
12 **DISTRICT OF ARIZONA**

13 MARIA M. GONZALEZ, et al.,  
14 Plaintiffs,  
15 v.  
16 STATE OF ARIZONA, et al.  
17 Defendants.

No. CV06-01268 PHX ROS  
No. CV06-1362 PCT ROS (Cons)  
No. CV06-1575 PCT ROS (Cons)

**REPLY IN SUPPORT OF  
NOTICE OF SPECIFIC  
OBJECTIONS TO ITCA PLAINTIFF  
EXHIBITS AND STATEMENTS OF  
ASSERTED FACT ON SUMMARY  
JUDGMENT BY DEFENDANT  
ARIZONA SECRETARY OF STATE**

(Assigned to the Honorable  
Roslyn O. Silver)

1 Pursuant to the Court's Order dated June 27, 2008, dkt. 881, Defendant Arizona  
2 Secretary of State ("Defendant") hereby provides replies in support of her notice of  
3 specific objections to individual exhibits filed by ITCA plaintiffs in opposition to  
4 summary judgment.

5 Attached at Tab 3 is a chart similar to the chart attached at Tab 2 of Defendant's  
6 notice, dkt. 885. The attached chart, however, incorporates Defendant's reply to ITCA  
7 plaintiffs' response on an exhibit-by-exhibit basis.

8 RESPECTFULLY SUBMITTED this 3rd day of July, 2008.

9 TERRY GODDARD  
10 Arizona Attorney General

11 s/ Barbara A. Bailey  
12 Mary O'Grady, Solicitor General  
13 Steven A. LaMar, Senior Litigation Counsel  
14 Carrie J. Brennan, Assistant Attorney General  
15 Barbara A. Bailey, Assistant Attorney General  
16 Attorneys for Defendants State of Arizona  
17 and Arizona Secretary of State Janice Brewer  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

1 **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

2 I hereby certify that on this 3rd day of July, 2008, I electronically transmitted  
3 the attached document to the Clerk's Office using the ECF System for filing, and  
4 transmittal of a Notice of Electronic Filing to the following ECF registrants:  
5

6 David J. Bodney  
7 Karen J. Hartman-Tellez  
8 Steptoe & Johnson LLP  
9 201 East Washington St., Ste. 1600  
10 Phoenix, Arizona 85004-2382  
11 [dbodney@steptoe.com](mailto:dbodney@steptoe.com)  
12 [khartman@steptoe.com](mailto:khartman@steptoe.com)

13 David B. Rosenbaum  
14 Thomas L. Hudson  
15 Sara S. Greene  
16 Osborn Maledon, P.A.  
17 2929 N. Central, 21<sup>st</sup> Floor  
18 Phoenix, Arizona 85012-2793  
19 [drosenbaum@omlaw.com](mailto:drosenbaum@omlaw.com)  
20 [thudson@omlaw.com](mailto:thudson@omlaw.com)  
21 [sgreene@omlaw.com](mailto:sgreene@omlaw.com)

22 Jon Greenbaum  
23 Benjamin Blustein  
24 Lawyers' Committee For  
25 Civil Rights Under Law  
26 1401 New York Avenue, Ste. 400  
27 Washington, D.C. 20005  
28 [jgreenbaum@lawyerscommittee.org](mailto:jgreenbaum@lawyerscommittee.org)

29 Neil Bradley  
30 ACLU Southern Regional Office  
31 2600 Marquis One Tower  
32 245 Peachtree Center Avenue  
33 Atlanta, Georgia 30303  
34 [nbradley@aclu.org](mailto:nbradley@aclu.org)

1 Elliot M. Mincberg  
2 People for the American  
3 Way Foundation  
4 2600 M Street, NW, Ste. 400  
5 Washington, DC 20036  
6 [eminberg@pfaw.org](mailto:eminberg@pfaw.org)

7 Daniel B. Kohrman  
8 AARP Foundation Litigation  
9 601 E Street, N.W., Ste. A4-240  
10 Washington, DC 20049  
11 [dkohrman@aarp.org](mailto:dkohrman@aarp.org)

12 Joe P. Sparks  
13 Susan B. Montgomery  
14 Sparks, Tehan & Ryley PC  
15 The Inter Tribal Council of Arizona, Inc.  
16 7503 First Street  
17 Scottsdale, Arizona 85251  
18 [joe-sparks@qwest.net](mailto:joe-sparks@qwest.net)

19 David J. Becker  
20 People for the American Way Foundation  
21 2000 M Street, NW, Suite 400  
22 Washington, D.C. 20036  
23 [dbecker@pfaw.org](mailto:dbecker@pfaw.org)

24 Daniel R. Ortega, Jr.  
25 Roush McCracken Guerrero  
26 Miller & Ortega  
27 650 N. 3<sup>rd</sup> Avenue  
28 Phoenix, Arizona 85003  
[danny@rmgmoinjurylaw.com](mailto:danny@rmgmoinjurylaw.com)

Nina Perales  
Mexican American Legal Defense and Education Fund  
110 Broadway, Ste. 300  
San Antonio, Texas 78205  
[nperales@maldef.org](mailto:nperales@maldef.org)

1 M. Colleen Connor  
2 MCAO Division of County Counsel  
3 222 N. Central Avenue, Ste. 1100  
4 Phoenix, Arizona 85003  
[connorc@mcao.maricopa.gov](mailto:connorc@mcao.maricopa.gov)

5 Dennis I. Wilenchik  
6 Kathleen Rapp  
7 Wilenchik and Bartness, P.C.  
8 2810 N. Third Street  
9 Phoenix, Arizona 85004  
[diw@wb-law.com](mailto:diw@wb-law.com)  
[kathleenr@wb-law.com](mailto:kathleenr@wb-law.com)

10 Judith M. Dworkin  
11 Marvin S. Cohen  
12 Patricia Ferguson-Bohnee  
13 SACKS TIERNEY P.A.  
14 4250 N. Drinkwater Blvd. 4<sup>th</sup>  
15 Scottsdale, Arizona 85251-3693  
[Judith.Dworkin@sackstierney.com](mailto:Judith.Dworkin@sackstierney.com)

16 Criss E. Candelaria  
17 Bradley Carlyon  
18 Apache County Attorneys Office  
19 PO Box 637  
20 St. Johns, Arizona 86025  
[bcarlyon@apachelaw.net](mailto:bcarlyon@apachelaw.net)

21 Melvin R. Bowers, Jr.  
22 Lance B. Payette  
23 Navajo County Attorneys Office  
24 PO Box 668  
25 Holbrook, Arizona 86025  
[lance.payette@co.navajo.az.us](mailto:lance.payette@co.navajo.az.us)

26 Brenna L. Clani  
27 Navajo County Department of Justice  
28 PO Box 2010  
Window Rock, Arizona 86515  
[brennalclani@navajo.org](mailto:brennalclani@navajo.org)

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

Jean E. Wilcox  
Coconino County Attorney's Office  
110 East Cherry Ave.  
Flagstaff, Arizona 86001  
[jwilcox@coconino.az.gov](mailto:jwilcox@coconino.az.gov)

**COPY** served the 3rd day of July, 2008, via U.S. mail, with Notice of Electronic Filing, on:

The Honorable Roslyn O. Silver  
United States District Court  
Sandra Day O'Connor U.S. Courthouse, Suite 624  
401 West Washington Street, SPC 59  
Phoenix, AZ 85003-2158

/s Elizabeth Stark

239500