

# Exhibit 8

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE DISTRICT OF ARIZONA

-----X

MARIA M. GONZALEZ, et al.,	:	
Plaintiffs,	:	Case Number
vs.	:	CV-06-1268-PHX-ROS
STATE OF ARIZONA, et al.,	:	CV-06-1362-PCT-ROS
Defendants.	:	CV-06-1575-PCT-ROS

-----X

30(b)(6) DEPOSITION OF GERRI RATLIFF

Washington, DC  
Tuesday, April 22, 2008

REPORTED BY:  
CARMEN SMITH

1 all caps -- and you already have done that -- we  
2 understand that together to mean the Systematic  
3 Aliens Verification for Entitlements program; is  
4 that right?

5 A Yes.

6 Q So SAVE is the acronym?

7 A Yes.

8 Q What is the database or databases upon  
9 which verification is performed in SAVE?

10 A The SAVE program -- a SAVE query is  
11 running a database called VIS, Verification  
12 Information System, so we'll use the acronym VIS,  
13 VIS. It is comprised of -- it's not a primary  
14 source database. It is comprised of nightly uploads  
15 of information from primary source databases. Those  
16 primary databases are the USCIS Central Index  
17 System, which is referred to as CIS, which gets very  
18 confusing with USCIS.

19 Also the IBIS system, IBIS, which is a  
20 CBP, Customs and Border Protection agency, system.  
21 That has information about noncitizen arrivals or  
22 class of admission for when they are arriving into

1 contractor, who maybe two weeks later gets around to  
2 data-entering it. So we may not get it in VIS until  
3 two weeks plus the next day for upload later.

4 But real-time arrival data, the inspector  
5 is entering real-time as the person enters. It's a  
6 new resource of data. We'll be getting that on May  
7 5 so that we'll have that information the next day,  
8 not have that lag.

9 And again, I know that will be used for  
10 E-verify purposes. I don't in my head actually know  
11 if it would be used for SAVE. But that would be  
12 very easy to find out.

13 Q Is it correct to say that VIS, although  
14 based on, for example, the Central Index System,  
15 doesn't necessarily contain all of the information  
16 about a particular alien that would be in Central  
17 Index System?

18 A I don't believe that we upload the entire  
19 Central Index System into VIS. We have a systems of  
20 records notice that I actually have, unless you  
21 already have it. It's on our Web site, and it's --  
22 can I give this to you now?

1 Q Yes, of course. Let's go ahead and mark  
2 this.

3 (Deposition Exhibit 3 identified.)

4 THE WITNESS: The system of records notice  
5 is a Privacy Act document that describes to the  
6 public how we use the information, public  
7 information that we gather, obviously from the  
8 public. So the public is aware of what we do with  
9 their information.

10 It fully describes what's in VIS. This is  
11 the PIA. This is a preliminary document, Privacy  
12 Act assessment comes first. Then the -- it's sort  
13 of a companion. But yeah, this is in the same realm  
14 of -- yes.

15 MS. PERALES: Let's go ahead and mark that  
16 as Exhibit 4.

17 (Deposition Exhibit 4 identified.)

18 THE WITNESS: Make sure this is the  
19 latest, you know. This last -- I can't see a date  
20 on --

21 BY MS. PERALES:

22 Q Let's take a look at the Web link. It's a

1 different --

2 A But definitely, you know, the SORN is what  
3 describes exactly the databases that are in VIS and  
4 how even to the data field level they are used.  
5 There are a few databases in VIS that SAVE doesn't  
6 access, so you probably don't want to know about  
7 them if they're not relevant for SAVE. But just so  
8 you're not like why does this mention ISRS. It's  
9 because ISRS is used for E-verify, and I don't think  
10 it has anything to do with the SAVE program.

11 Q There was some earlier testimony by  
12 Mr. Quinn that the Central Index System might, for  
13 example, for a particular person include a history  
14 of the benefits sought --

15 A Yes.

16 Q -- by that individual?

17 A Yes.

18 Q Is that in VIS?

19 A No. VIS is only current status  
20 information. It does not include a history.

21 Q And so, for example, Mr. Quinn testified  
22 that the Central Index System record for a

1 particular person, if that person naturalized, would  
2 include the number of the Certificate of  
3 Naturalization. Is that information in VIS?

4 A I don't think so, but that could easily be  
5 found out, whether -- whatever that process is of  
6 getting back.

7 Q Would that information --

8 A I mean, I just don't know in my head.

9 Q Would that information, or the answer to  
10 that question, be contained in the document that's  
11 referenced in Exhibit 3?

12 A It should be, because the SORN describes  
13 all the data fields that we're using, and so if --  
14 if Certificate of Naturalization is not included, it  
15 means we're not getting it.

16 And I do know that for at least the Web 1  
17 access method, the primary query is not by  
18 Certificate of Naturalization number; it's by  
19 A-number.

20 Q Thank you. You had mentioned that  
21 E-verify is a sister program of the SAVE program; is  
22 that correct?

1           A     Yes.

2           Q     What is the purpose of the E-verify  
3     system?

4           A     E-verify is a program that employers  
5     voluntarily participate in to verify the work  
6     authorization status of their new hires. It can  
7     include government agencies who are -- for their new  
8     hires of, you know, their government staff, and it  
9     does.

10          And it verifies -- unlike SAVE, it  
11     verifies all new hires, noncitizens, naturalized  
12     citizens, U.S.-born citizens, derivative citizens,  
13     you know.

14          And it verifies their citizenship or  
15     immigration status and it verifies their Social  
16     Security number.

17          Q     Would it be correct to say that the SAVE  
18     verification system is used primarily to verify  
19     noncitizen eligibility for public benefits?

20          A     Yes.

21          Q     And is it also used commonly for  
22     noncitizen verification for the purpose of issuing

1 driver's licenses under REAL ID?

2 A Not specifically under REAL ID, because  
3 REAL ID isn't quite effective yet. But we have over  
4 half of the states are already using the SAVE  
5 program to verify noncitizen status for their  
6 driver's license issuances, not under the umbrella  
7 of REAL ID, but certainly as a footprint towards  
8 eventually that.

9 (Deposition Exhibit 5 identified.)

10 BY MS. PERALES:

11 Q Ms. Ratliff, we are handing you what the  
12 court reporter has marked Deposition Exhibit 5. Can  
13 you identify this document?

14 A This appears to be a printout from our Web  
15 page, our USCIS Web page, about the SAVE program.

16 Q And does this document generally describe  
17 the SAVE program and its uses?

18 A Yes, yes, it does.

19 Q And is it correct to say, as described on  
20 page 2 of the document, that SAVE was created in  
21 response to congressional enactment of Immigration  
22 Reform and Control Act and specifically the

1 requirement that DHS establish a system for  
2 verifying immigration status of noncitizen  
3 applicants for and recipients of certain types of  
4 federally funded benefits?

5 A Yes.

6 Q And then I know the document moves down  
7 into describing another statute, PRWORA, Personal  
8 Responsibility and Work Opportunity.

9 Is it correct to say, I guess, then, that  
10 the SAVE system evolved to then provide government  
11 agencies with information to assist them in  
12 determining noncitizen eligibility under title 4 of  
13 PRWORA, P-R-W-O-R-A?

14 A Yes.

15 Q You had mentioned before that the VIS  
16 database relies on a number of other databases as  
17 its primary sources. And I wanted to ask if VIS  
18 contains or relates to the RNACS database, RNACS?

19 A Today, no. In terms of holding -- today  
20 VIS does not hold RNACS information. RNACS is a  
21 database that was used for a period and has been  
22 replaced by CLAIMS 4 for naturalization case

1 management, adjudication and status.

2 But one of our May 5 enhancements to  
3 E-verify is adding RNACS data to VIS. So in just a  
4 few weeks, my answer would have to change, because  
5 it's in system testing now.

6 I don't -- again, I don't know to what --  
7 I don't know if SAVE queries will access RNACS. I  
8 only happen to know today that E-verify will.

9 Q Is E-verify going to this new phase of  
10 communicating with CLAIMS 4 for the purpose of  
11 reducing the rate of tentative nonconfirmations of  
12 naturalized citizens that E-verify has?

13 A Yes.

14 Q So this is a step towards trying to  
15 improve the confirmation rate for naturalized  
16 citizens in E-verify?

17 A Yes.

18 Q Would it be correct to say that with  
19 respect to SAVE, that relatively few verifications  
20 are conducted to determine U.S. citizenship?

21 A Yes.

22 Q And is it, in fact, correct that only the

1 State of Arizona uses SAVE to verify U.S.  
2 citizenship for voter registration?

3 A Yes, currently.

4 Q Can you give me examples of other agencies  
5 that would go into SAVE to verify United States  
6 citizenship?

7 A I don't know. I really don't know. I  
8 brought the list of all of our SAVE users to give  
9 you, but I really -- I really don't know.

10 Q If we have a list of users, we're still  
11 not necessarily sure the purpose for which they are  
12 using SAVE; is that right?

13 A Correct. For some of them, you could look  
14 at the name of it and it would be self-evident and  
15 some it might not be.

16 Q But none of the users are self-evidently  
17 using SAVE for U.S. citizenship verification, other  
18 than recorders in Arizona right now?

19 A I'm only aware of the voter registration  
20 use of SAVE to confirm naturalization status. There  
21 could be other purposes, but I don't -- I'm not  
22 aware of them.

1           Q     Let's go ahead and mark the document that  
2 you brought, if it's okay with you.

3           A     Yes.

4                     (Deposition Exhibit 6 identified.)

5                     BY MS. PERALES:

6           Q     Tell me what Exhibit 6 is.

7           A     It is -- Exhibit 6 is a list of the  
8 current SAVE -- the current government agencies who  
9 are authorized to use SAVE, that means they have  
10 signed an MOU to use SAVE. And I actually was just  
11 thinking that there could be some DMVs who are  
12 verifying naturalization status for driver's  
13 licenses, but I -- I don't know for sure. That  
14 would be a context -- a fact pattern where they  
15 might need to do that.

16           Q     That would only be in the case of a DMV  
17 that confirmed citizenship status, as opposed to  
18 lawful presence as part of their driver's  
19 license-issuing process?

20           A     Not necessarily. If a DMV's current  
21 requirements pre-REAL ID are to prove citizenship,  
22 someone might do that -- if they were naturalized,

1           Q     And yes, you are correct that the Arizona  
2 voter registration form does accept a driver's  
3 license as proof of U.S. citizenship, and we'll save  
4 for another day what that's about.

5                     (Deposition Exhibit 7 identified.)

6           BY MS. PERALES:

7           Q     Let me just check with you with respect to  
8 Exhibit 6. Is the information about SAVE account  
9 holders or SAVE participants public information? Is  
10 there anything --

11          A     Yes.

12          Q     -- confidential in this document that we  
13 need to protect?

14          A     No, no.

15          Q     I'm going to hand you what has been marked  
16 Deposition Exhibit 7. Can you identify this  
17 document?

18          A     This appears to be the USCIS -- or  
19 Department of Homeland Security PIA, Privacy Impact  
20 Assessment, for VIS, which is one of the Privacy Act  
21 documents that are published in a Federal Register  
22 to let the public know how we're using their