

1 ANDREW P. THOMAS
MARICOPA COUNTY ATTORNEY
2 By: Colleen Connor (# 015679)
Deputy County Attorney
MCAO Firm No. 00032000
3 CIVIL DIVISION
222 North Central Avenue, Suite 1100
4 Phoenix, Arizona 85004-2206
Telephone (602) 506-0128
5 connorc@mcao.maricopa.gov

6 Dennis I. Wilenchik (# 05350)
Kathleen Rapp (# 023982)
WILENCHIK AND BARTNESS, P.C.
7 The Wilenchik & Bartness Building
2810 North Third Street
8 Phoenix, Arizona 85004
Telephone (602) 606-2810
9 DIW@wb-law.com; KatheenR@wb-law.com
Attorneys for County Defendants

10 **IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**
11 **FOR THE DISTRICT OF ARIZONA**

12 **MARIA M. GONZALEZ; JESUS M.**
13 **GONZALES; BERNIE ABEYTIA;**
14 **LUCIANO VALENCIA; DEBBIE**
15 **LOPEZ, SOUTHWEST VOTER**
16 **REGISTRATION EDUCATION**
17 **PROJECT; VALLE DEL SOL;**
18 **FRIENDLY HOUSE; CHICANOS POR**
19 **LA CAUSA, INC.; and ARIZONA**
20 **HISPANIC FORUM,**

21 **Plaintiffs,**

22 **v.**

23 **STATE OF ARIZONA, JAN BREWER,**
24 **in her official capacity as the Secretary of**
25 **State of the State of Arizona, et al.,**

26 **Defendants.**

No. CV06-1268-PHX ROS (Lead)
No. CV06-1362-PCT-JAT
No. CV06-1575-PHX-EHC

**TWELVE COUNTY
DEFENDANTS' JOINDER TO
STATE DEFENDANTS'
OBJECTION TO STIPULATION
RE AUTHENTICITY AND
ADMISSIBILITY OF TRIAL
EXHIBITS**

**(Assigned to the
Honorable Roslyn O. Silver)**

1 Defendants Maricopa County Recorder Helen Purcell and Maricopa County
2 Elections Director Karen Osborne; Apache County Recorder LeNora Johnson and
3 Apache County Elections Director Penny L. Pew; Cochise County Recorder Christine
4 Rhodes and Cochise County Elections Director Thomas Schelling; Gila County
5 Recorder Linda Haught Ortega and Gila County Elections Director Dixie Mundy;
6 Graham County Recorder Wendy John and Graham County Elections Director Judy
7 Dickerson; Greenlee County Recorder Berta Manuz and Greenlee County Elections
8 Director Yvonne Pearson; La Paz County Recorder Shelly Baker and La Paz County
9 Elections Director Donna Hale; Mohave County Recorder Joan McCall and Mohave
10 County Elections Director Allen Tempert; Pima County Recorder F. Ann Rodriguez and
11 Pima County Elections Director Brad R. Nelson; Santa Cruz County Recorder Suzie
12 Sainz and Santa Cruz County Elections Director Melinda Meek; Yavapai County
13 Recorder Ana Wayman-Trujillo and Yavapai County Elections Director Lynn A.
14 Constabile; and Yuma County Recorder Susan Hightower Marler and Yuma County
15 Elections Director Patti Madrill (collectively “County Defendants”), by and through
undersigned counsel, hereby joins the State Defendants’ Objections to the Stipulations
re Authenticity and Admissibility of Trial Exhibits between the Gonzalez Plaintiffs and
Navajo and Coconino County Defendants.

16 The County Defendants have received and reviewed the July 3, 2008 Objections
17 filed by Defendants State of Arizona and Secretary of State (“State Defendants”) in this
18 matter. Dkt. 907, 911. The State’s Objections correctly set forth the position of County
19 Defendants. Accordingly, the County Defendants join in the State Defendants objections and
specifically reserve all objections to the admissibility of evidence at trial.

20 ///

21 ///

22

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22

DATED this 3rd day of July, 2008.

ANDREW P. THOMAS
MARICOPA COUNTY ATTORNEY

BY: s/ Kathleen E. Rapp

WILENCHIK & BARTNESS, P.C.
Dennis I. Wilenchik, Esq.
Kathleen E. Rapp, Esq.
The Wilenchik & Bartness Building
2810 North Third Street
Phoenix, Arizona 85004

COLLEEN CONNOR
Deputy County Attorney
222 North Central Avenue, Suite 1100
Phoenix, Arizona 85004-2206
Attorneys for County Defendants

1 CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

2 I hereby certify that on the 3rd day of July, 2008, I caused the foregoing document
3 to be electronically transmitted to the Clerk's Office using the CM/ECF System for filing
4 and transmittal of a Notice of Electronic Filing to the following CM/ECF Registrants:

5 David J. Bodney
6 Karen J. Hartman-Tellez
7 Steptoe & Johnson LLP
8 201 E. Washington St., Ste. 1600
9 Phoenix, Arizona 85004-2382
10 dbodney@steptoe.com
11 khartman@steptoe.com

David B. Rosenbaum
Thomas L. Hudson
Sara S. Greene
Osborn Maledon, P.A.
2929 N. Central Ave., 21st Floor
Phoenix, Arizona 85012-2793
drosenbaum@omlaw.com
thudson@omlaw.com
sgreene@omlaw.com

10 Jon Greenbaum
11 Benjamin Blustein
12 Lawyers' Committee For
13 Civil Rights Under Law
14 1401 New York Avenue, Ste. 400
15 Washington, D.C. 20005
16 jgreenbaum@lawyerscommittee.org

Neil Bradley
ACLU Southern Regional Office
2600 Marquis One Tower
245 Peachtree Center Avenue
Atlanta, Georgia 30303
nbradley@aclu.org

14 Elliot M. Minberg
15 People for the American
16 Way Foundation
17 2600 M Street, NW, Ste. 400
18 Washington, DC 20036
19 eminberg@pfaw.org

Luis Roberto Vera, Jr.
League of United Latin
American Citizens
111 Soledad, Ste. 1325
San Antonio, Texas 78205-2260
Irvlaw@sbcglobal.net

18 Daniel B. Kohrman
19 AARP Foundation Litigation
20 601 E Street, N.W., Ste. A4-240
21 Washington, DC 20049
22 dkohrman@aarp.org

Joe P. Sparks
Susan B. Montgomery
Sparks, Tehan & Ryley PC
The Inter Tribal Council of Arizona, Inc
7503 First Street
Scottsdale, Arizona 85251
joe-sparks@qwest.net

1 David J. Becker
People for the American Way Foundation
2 2000 M Street, NW, Suite 400
Washington, D.C. 20036
3 dbecker@paw.org

4
5 Nina Perales
Mexican American Legal Defense
and Education Fund
6 110 Broadway, Ste. 300
San Antonio, Texas 78205
7 nperales@maldef.org

8
9 Judith M. Dworkin
Marvin S. Cohen
10 Patricia Ferguson-Bohnee
SACKS TIERNEY P.A.
11 4250 N. Drinkwater Blvd. 4th
Scottsdale, Arizona 85251-3693
12 Judith.Dworkin@sackstierney.com

13 Melvin R. Bowers, Jr.
Lance B. Payette
14 Navajo County Attorneys Office
PO Box 668
15 Holbrook, Arizona 86025
lance.payette@co.navajo.az.us

16
17 Jean E. Wilcox
Coconino County Attorney's Office
110 East Cherry Avenue
18 Flagstaff, Arizona 86001
jwilcox@coconino.az.gov

Daniel R. Ortega, Jr.
Roush McCracken Guerrero
Miller & Ortega
650 North 3rd Avenue
Phoenix, Arizona 85003
danny@rmgmoinjurylaw.com

Mary O'Grady
Solicitor General
Carrie J. Brennan
Barbara A. Bailey
Assistant Attorneys General
1275 West Washington Street
Phoenix, Arizona 85007-2926
Mary.OGrady@azag.gov

Criss E. Candelaria
Bradley Carlyon
Apache County Attorneys Office
PO Box 637
St. Johns, Arizona 86025
bcarlyon@apachelaw.net

Brenna L. Clani
Navajo County Department of Justice
PO Box 2010
Window Rock, Arizona 86515
brennalclani@navajo.org

20
21
22

1 COPY of the foregoing filed electronically
this 3rd day of July, 2008.

2
3 COPY of the foregoing mailed with Notice of
Electronic Filing this 3rd day of July, 2008 to:

4 The Honorable Roslyn O. Silver
United States District Court
5 Sandra Day O'Connor U.S. Courthouse, Suite 624
401 West Washington Street, SPC 59
6 Phoenix, AZ 85003-2158

7

8 /s Tonya Mills

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22